

Title: Proposed screening criteria application spreadsheet

7/7/2005

The purpose of this workbook is to serve as a framework and guide with which to screen the full list of potential restoration projects. The screening criteria incorporated into this workbook were initially outlined in the January 24, 2005 draft confidential memorandum titled "Proposed project selection criteria".

These screening criteria are used as the first step in project evaluation. Projects must pass screening criteria before they can be considered further in the evaluation process. We propose that each potential project be evaluated on a yes/no basis as to whether they meet the following screening criteria. In general, potential projects should meet all of these minimum standards of acceptability to be carried forward into the evaluation phase.

Input either "Y" or "N" based on how each potential project meets the individual screening criteria.

Project	Addresses type of resources injured or services lost due to injury	Complies with applicable and relevant federal, state, and local, laws and regulations	Protective of public health and safety	Is technically and administratively feasible	Does not conflict with any ongoing or planned response or remediation work	Provides a net environmental benefit	Acceptability	Comments
Habitat Improvements to ponds and lakes								
Upper Cabresto Creek cutthroat trout enhancement via pond creation	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Additional water rights might be needed because of evaporative losses at ponds
Fawn Lakes -- habitat improvements	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Potato Patch Spring habitat creation	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes*	Yes	Yes	Yes	Bentonite clay liner would be necessary to hold water, possibly issues with SW supply WQ
Goathill Pond habitat creation	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes*	Yes	Yes*	Yes	There is concern that sediment buildup over a long period of time could potentially present a wildlife risk if metal concentrations are high in the sediment. Also, an easement may be associated with the power line, which could prevent certain actions.
Eagle Rock Lake habitat improvement and creation	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Hunts pond improvements	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes*	Yes	Yes*	Yes	Project would require significant changes from current implementation by town of Questa; administrative feasibility not clear. The size, depth, and solar exposure could lead to the need for constant chemical treatment to kill unwanted aquatic vegetation.
Shuree ponds improvement; Valle Vidal area	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Projects to benefit instream communities and/or riparian habitat								
Cabresto fish barrier to benefit cutthroat trout	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes*	Yes	Yes	Yes	Technical feasibility (ability to isolate cutthroat trout) depends on location of barrier
Lower Cabresto water augmentation	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes*	Yes	Yes	Yes	Water rights law may prevent the technical feasibility of this project (ability to maintain in-stream flows)
Columbine Park Pond Complex habitat creation	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Pond creation would require a liner to prevent intrusion of highly contaminated groundwater; risk of failure of liner is high
Red River habitat improvements in the town of Red River	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes*	Yes	Yes	Yes	May require cooperation of private landowners
State fish hatchery fish ladder construction	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Questa Ranger Station fish barrier removal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Village of Questa Red River habitat improvements	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes*	Yes	Yes	Yes	May require cooperation of private landowners
Mainstem Red River Embeddedness Treatment/Study	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes*	Yes	Yes*	Yes	Long-term effectiveness of project is unlikely, given high loads of sediments in Red River.
Rio Costilla aquatic enhancement	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
McCrystal creek headgate	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Comanche Creek cutthroat migration barrier	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Restore Rio Grande cutthroat trout in Comanche Creek	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes*	Yes	Yes	Yes	Technical feasibility of restoring Rio Grande cutthroat trout depends on cooperation of NMDGF and availability of cutthroat stock
Projects to benefit surface water quality for streams and rivers								

Project	Addresses type of resources injured or services lost due to injury	Complies with applicable and relevant federal, state, and local, laws and regulations	Protective of public health and safety	Is technically and administratively feasible	Does not conflict with any ongoing or planned response or remediation work	Provides a net environmental benefit	Acceptability	Comments	
Bitter Creek Drainage Improvements	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes*	No	Depending on the type of drainage improvement, public safety/liability could be an issue (as with the existing dam). Also, all parties involved seem to have very low opinions of this projects feasibility and potential for success over time not technically feasible because systems are up high and would most likely not capture enough drainage to make a difference in total load to the river	
Construction of acid drainage capture systems	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No		
Stream Crossing Improvements -- Comanche Creek and North Ponil Creek	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Forest Service Road Reconstruction near ranger station	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Obliterate road and return to natural contours -- Chuck Wagon Creek and Gold Creek	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Mitigation of off-road vehicle impacts to the watershed	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
General Road improvements in the watershed	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Rio Grande box recreational facilities development	Yes*	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		Primary focus is recreational improvement, not surface water improvement
Cebolla Mesa trail improvement	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes*	Yes		Primary focus is recreational improvement, not surface water improvement
Projects to improve or protect terrestrial or wetland habitat									
Sunshine Valley/Anderson ranch wetland site	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	This is an inholding in the Valle Vidal, environmental benefit would come from eliminating risk of development and it is unknown whether this parcel is at risk	
Improve winter range for bighorn sheep	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Land acquisition of LaBelle property	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes*	Yes		
Alluvial fan habitat enhancement along the Red River	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Fawn Lakes riparian improvement (revegetation)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
Projects to conserve water use, benefit groundwater quality, or develop groundwater resources for human use									
Well and distribution system for Lama	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	This project does not actually improve quality or increase quantity of stored groundwater, it would actually lead to increased withdrawals from the aquifer Clower springs water does not meet NMED wq standards and is not a permitted well, it therefore does not comply with regulations. It is also not known whether this project would eliminated the coliform problem but could increase the number of people using this source so it could possibly detrimentally affect public health. It also does not provide a net environmental benefit (since wildlife would be restricted from a surface water source)	
Clower Springs groundwater protection	Yes	No	Yes*	No	Yes	No	No		

Project	Addresses type of resources injured or services lost due to injury	Complies with applicable and relevant federal, state, and local, laws and regulations	Protective of public health and safety	Is technically and administratively feasible	Does not conflict with any ongoing or planned response or remediation work	Provides a net environmental benefit	Acceptability	Comments
Village of Questa water distribution improvement	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Development of Water Conservation Programs	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Village of Questa WWTP upgrade	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes*	Yes	Basins have already been lined. Unknown what other actions would be taken and how that would provide environmental benefit
Red River WWTP sludge-drying basin lining	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Red River underground storage tank remediation	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	Remediation for underground storage tanks not required; no known issues of groundwater contamination
Septic system concerns in Lama or San Cristobal	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes*	Yes	Uncertain of if, how and where septic are having an adverse impact. GW plumes?
Construction of small retention dams for groundwater storage	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No	Not feasible due to need for additional water rights
Public education about beavers and restoration	Yes*	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes*	Yes	No direct link between education program and service loss to groundwater
Projects primarily related to recreation or tourism								
Funding for promotion of outdoor activity related tourism	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	No direct environmental benefit from promoting tourism

Project	Addresses type of resources injured or services lost due to injury	Complies with applicable and relevant federal, state, and local laws and regulations	Protective of public health and safety	Is technically and administratively feasible	Does not conflict with any ongoing or planned response or remediation work	Provides a net environmental benefit	Acceptability	Comments
---------	--	--	--	--	--	--------------------------------------	---------------	----------

Habitat Improvements to ponds and lakes

Upper Cabresto Creek cutthroat trout enhancement via pond creation
Fawn Lakes -- habitat improvements
Potato Patch Spring habitat creation
Goathill Pond habitat creation
Eagle Rock Lake habitat improvement and creation
Hunts pond improvements
Shuree ponds improvement; Valle Vidal area

Projects to benefit instream communities and/or riparian habitat

Cabresto fish barrier to benefit cutthroat trout
Lower Cabresto water augmentation
Columbine Park Pond Complex habitat creation
Red River habitat improvements in the town of Red River
State fish hatchery fish ladder construction
Questa Ranger Station fish barrier removal

Project	Addresses type of resources injured or services lost due to injury	Complies with applicable and relevant federal, state, and local laws and regulations	Protective of public health and safety	Is technically and administratively feasible	Does not conflict with any ongoing or planned response or remediation work	Provides a net environmental benefit	Acceptability	Comments
Village of Questa Red River habitat improvements Mainstem Red River Embeddedness Treatment/Study Rio Costilla aquatic enhancement McCrystal creek headgate Comanche Creek cutthroat migration barrier Restore Rio Grande cutthroat trout in Comanche Creek								

Projects to benefit surface water quality for streams and rivers

Bitter Creek Drainage Improvements
Construction of acid drainage capture systems
Stream Crossing Improvements -- Comanche Creek and North Ponil Creek
Forest Service Road Reconstruction near ranger station
Obliterate road and return to natural contours – Chuck Wagon Creek and Gold Creek

Project	Addresses type of resources injured or services lost due to injury	Complies with applicable and relevant federal, state, and local laws and regulations	Protective of public health and safety	Is technically and administratively feasible	Does not conflict with any ongoing or planned response or remediation work	Provides a net environmental benefit	Acceptability	Comments
Mitigation of off-road vehicle impacts to the watershed								
General Road improvements in the watershed								
Rio Grande box recreational facilities development								
Cebolla Mesa trail improvement								
Projects to improve or protect terrestrial or wetland habitat								
Sunshine Valley/Anderson ranch wetland site								
Improve winter range for bighorn sheep								
Land acquisition of LaBelle property								
Alluvial fan habitat enhancement along the Red River								
Fawn Lakes riparian improvement (revegetation)								
Projects to conserve water use, benefit groundwater quality, or develop groundwater resources for human use								
Well and distribution system for Lama								
Clower Springs groundwater protection								
Village of Questa water distribution improvement								

Project	Addresses type of resources injured or services lost due to injury	Complies with applicable and relevant federal, state, and local laws and regulations	Protective of public health and safety	Is technically and administratively feasible	Does not conflict with any ongoing or planned response or remediation work	Provides a net environmental benefit	Acceptability	Comments
Development of Water Conservation Programs								
Village of Questa WWTP upgrade								
Red River WWTP sludge-drying basin lining								
Red River underground storage tank remediation								
Septic system concerns in Lama or San Cristobal								
Construction of small retention dams for groundwater storage								
Public education about beavers and restoration								
Projects primarily related to recreation or tourism								
Funding for promotion of outdoor activity related tourism								

Upper Cabresto Creek cutthroat trout enhancement via pond creation	Stream Crossing Improvements -- Comanche Creek and North Ponil Creek
Fawn Lakes -- habitat improvements	Forest Service Road Reconstruction near ranger station
Potato Patch Spring habitat creation	Obliterate road and return to natural contours – Chuck Wagon Creek and Gold Creek
Goathill Pond habitat creation	Mitigation of off-road vehicle impacts to the watershed
Eagle Rock Lake habitat improvement and creation	General Road improvements in the watershed
Hunts pond improvements	Rio Grande box recreational facilities development
Shuree ponds improvement; Valle Vidal area	Cebolla Mesa trail improvement
Cabresto fish barrier to benefit cutthroat trout	Sunshine Valley/Anderson ranch wetland site
Lower Cabresto water augmentation	Improve winter range for bighorn sheep
Red River habitat improvements in the town of Red River	Land acquisition of LaBelle property
State fish hatchery fish ladder construction	Alluvial fan habitat enhancement along the Red River
Questa Ranger Station fish barrier removal	Fawn Lakes riparian improvement (revegetation)
Village of Questa Red River habitat improvements	Village of Questa water distribution improvement
Mainstem Red River Embeddedness Treatment/Study	Development of Water Conservation Programs
Rio Costilla aquatic enhancement	Village of Questa WWTP upgrade
McCrystal creek headgate	Red River WWTP sludge-drying basin lining
Comanche Creek cutthroat migration barrier	Septic system concerns in Lama or San Cristobal
Restore Rio Grande cutthroat trout in Comanche Creek	Public education about beavers and restoration

Table 1: Projects recommended to be accepted for further analysis as a result of the Stratus Consulting analysis

Columbine Park Pond Complex habitat creation
Bitter Creek Drainage Improvements
Construction of acid drainage capture systems
Well and distribution system for Lama
Clower Springs groundwater protection
Red River underground storage tank remediation
Construction of small retention dams for groundwater storage
Funding for promotion of outdoor activity related tourism

Table 1: Projects recommended to be removed as a result of the Stratus Consulting analysis

List linked to screening criteria worksheet

Project Name

Upper Cabresto Creek cutthroat trout enhancement via pond creation
Fawn Lakes -- habitat improvements
Potato Patch Spring habitat creation
Goathill Pond habitat creation
Eagle Rock Lake habitat improvement and creation
Hunts pond improvements

Shuree ponds improvement; Valle Vidal area

#N/A

Cabresto fish barrier to benefit cutthroat trout
Lower Cabresto water augmentation
Columbine Park Pond Complex habitat creation
Red River habitat improvements in the town of Red River
State fish hatchery fish ladder construction
Questa Ranger Station fish barrier removal
Village of Questa Red River habitat improvements
Mainstem Red River Embeddedness Treatment/Study
Rio Costilla aquatic enhancement
McCrystal creek headgate
Comanche Creek cutthroat migration barrier
Restore Rio Grande cutthroat trout in Comanche Creek

Project Name

Upper Cabresto Creek cutthroat trout enhancement via pond creation
Fawn Lakes -- habitat improvements
Potato Patch Spring habitat creation
Goathill Pond habitat creation

Eagle Rock Lake habitat improvement and creation
Hunts pond improvements

Shuree ponds improvement; Valle Vidal area

#N/A

Cabresto fish barrier to benefit cutthroat trout
Lower Cabresto water augmentation

Columbine Park Pond Complex habitat creation

Red River habitat improvements in the town of Red River
State fish hatchery fish ladder construction
Questa Ranger Station fish barrier removal

Village of Questa Red River habitat improvements

Mainstem Red River Embeddedness Treatment/Study
Rio Costilla aquatic enhancement
McCrystal creek headgate
Comanche Creek cutthroat migration barrier

Restore Rio Grande cutthroat trout in Comanche Creek

Stream Crossing Improvements -- Comanche
Creek and North Ponil Creek
Forest Service Road Reconstruction near
ranger station

Obliterate road and return to natural contours –
Chuck Wagon Creek and Gold Creek
Mitigation of off-road vehicle impacts to the
watershed

General Road improvements in the watershed
Rio Grande box recreational facilities
development
Cebolla Mesa trail improvement

Sunshine Valley/Anderson ranch wetland site
Improve winter range for bighorn sheep
Land acquisition of LaBelle property
Alluvial fan habitat enhancement along the Red
River
Fawn Lakes riparian improvement
(revegetation)
Village of Questa water distribution
improvement

Development of Water Conservation Programs
Village of Questa WWTP upgrade
Red River WWTP sludge-drying basin lining
Septic system concerns in Lama or San
Cristobal

Public education about beavers and restoration

Stream Crossing Improvements -- Comanche Creek and North Ponil Creek

Forest Service Road Reconstruction near ranger station

Obliterate road and return to natural contours – Chuck Wagon Creek and Gold C

Mitigation of off-road vehicle impacts to the watershed

General Road improvements in the watershed

Rio Grande box recreational facilities development
Cebolla Mesa trail improvement

Sunshine Valley/Anderson ranch wetland site
Improve winter range for bighorn sheep
Land acquisition of LaBelle property

Alluvial fan habitat enhancement along the Red River

Fawn Lakes riparian improvement (revegetation)

Village of Questa water distribution improvement

Development of Water Conservation Programs
Village of Questa WWTP upgrade
Red River WWTP sludge-drying basin lining

Septic system concerns in Lama or San Cristobal

Public education about beavers and restoration